



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

September 5, 2013 – NEW BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:05 p.m.

Staff in attendance: M. Voigt, HDC Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp

Absent Members: Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger

Late Arrivals: Hill-Holdgate 1:47 p.m.

Early Departures: Camp 2:43 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

n/a

III. 60-DAY DEADLINES

n/a

IV. OLD BUSINESS

1. Maria Mitchell Assn. 31 Washington Street – HSAB Revisions: Building #3 42.3.2-82.3 M. Fader

Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Camp

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing **Marsha Feder** – Presented project.

John Daniels, President Board of Directors

Public None

Concerns (1:06) No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Camp)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate # **60138**

2. Maria Mitchell Assn. 31 Washington Street – HSAB Revisions: Building #4 42.3.2-82.3 M. Fader

Sitting Williams, McLaughlin, Camp

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.

Representing **Marsha Feder** – Presented project.

John Daniels, President of the Board

Public None

Concerns (1:06) No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Camp)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate # **60139**

Minutes for September 5, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

3.	Jakovik, Nancy	22 Nanahumacke Lane	Revisions: new dwelling	57-27	Rowland Assoc.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Ben Normand , Rowland and Associates – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.				
	Jeff Kuschuluk				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:16) Staff – Read previous concerns.				
	Camp – No concerns.				
	McLaughlin – West elevation is visible from a fire lane off Millbrook Road.				
	Williams – Get rid of the flare in the roof. Would like to see the color go to a grey.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff without the flare on the gambrel. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60140	
4.	Oak Hill Investments	7 S. Valley Road	Revisions: dwelling	43-142	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Alex Bagmet , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:23) Staff – Read previous concerns. Stated might need an extension agreement.				
	Discussion about the extension request and the possibility of an extension violation.				
	McLaughlin – South elevation, right side dormer “F” window and the “D” window are not appropriate; should be double hung. All the meeting rails should align.				
	Camp – (Comments not audible.)				
	Williams – Have the same issue with the dormers; previous submittal dormers worked better. Front elevation right side dormer is too large; plate height is 10’9” and front door needs to be a standard 6-panel. The “A” windows in the secondary masses are too large; should be “B” windows. Rear elevation is still a long plane but not visible; second-floor dormers might be visible.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
5.	Oak Hill Investments	7 S. Valley Road	Hardscaping: pool	43-142	M. Ahern
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Miroslava Ahern – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:39) McLaughlin – No comments.				
	Camp – No concerns.				
	Williams – The project is approvable but must continue to track with the house.				
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the new dwelling. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		

Minutes for September 5, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

6.	Viano, Susan	7A Crooked Lane	New dwelling	41-80.1	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Susan Viano – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:50) Staff – Read previous concerns. Camp – Windows need to drop one size; the panes are still too vertical. McLaughlin – No comments. Williams – Agree with Camp; but when they drop in size, another set of windows should be added.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60141	
7.	Avenue Dolphin LLC	6 Dolphin Court	Revisions: new dwelling	42.4.1-113	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented redesigned proposal.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:55) Staff – Read previous concerns. Hill-Holdgate – Thought the last design was close and don't mind the gambrel; the side wing eaves should drop and front door should either have glass and no sidelights or be solid with sidelights. Camp – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. Dropping the ridge would make the wings less massive. McLaughlin – Pergola over the shower is odd. Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. Williams – Structure is 68 feet long and front door is inappropriate. Complete visibility of the rear from Easton Street. External chimney should be moved interior.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
8.	Elzay, Michael	43 Pine Street – HSAB	Hardscaping: apron	55.4.1-158	M. Elzay
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	(1:15) Held until Hill-Holdgate arrives. (1:48) Staff – Read previous concerns. Held until the proper plans arrive. (2:03) Hill-Holdgate – Had asked for an actual survey plan. Discussion about driveway material.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the brick extending in 10 feet further. (Hill-Holdgate)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60142	
9.	Miner, Lauren	12 S. Valley Road	Revisions	43-139	JMS Architecture
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	(2:05) No quorum.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of Sept 10 meeting. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		

Minutes for September 5, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

10. Ouren, Christine	10 Fifth Way	Revisions/information “Swan”	67-265	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:06) Staff – Read previous concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60143	
11. Ouren, Christine	10 Fifth Way	Revisions: “Gull”	67-265	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:08) Staff – Read previous concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60144	
12. Keilley, James	26 Gosnold Road	Revisions: new dwelling	30-89	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed changes. Explained constraints of the site. Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Increased from 1 to 2 stories.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:09) Staff – Read previous concerns. McLaughlin – In the north elevation gable there is space to add an “E” window. Hill-Holdgate – This is being constructed on the highest point of the lot. Like the former design better; it looked more like a house that had been there a long time; just wanted the dormers scaled back to single windows. The back gable was too tall, now the front is too tall. The massive exterior chimney is a concern. Agree about the gap between the 1 st -floor and 2 nd -floor windows. Camp – Agree. North elevation seems overly fenestrated. Williams – Plate height needs to come down; the 10-foot plate height drives up building height and the size of the windows, which are too large. Front door needs more trim. Liked the original 1½-story submittal if the double dormers had been reduced some, though not necessarily down to single windows. Cross gable and 2 nd -floor decks do not help. Proportions need to be readjusted.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
13. T.O.O. Development	36 Baxter Road – SAB	Revisions	49.2.3-3	JGGA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Michelle Bellerjeau , J. Graham Goldsmith Architects – Stated a letter detailing the changes had been submitted.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:21) No quorum: Williams, Hill-Holdgate and Coombs. Discussion about the when the lack of quorum became common knowledge and the procedure from here forward.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to be the first item on the September 10 agenda. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

14. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	15-43	CWA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan Griffin , Chip Webster Architecture – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:30) Staff – Read previous concerns. McLaughlin – South elevation and north elevation two “C” windows are down as casements; should be fixed. Hill-Holdgate – Glass in the connecting piece is atypical; should be more in keeping such as the “E” window. Pointy railing detail looks strange. Tower piece white paneling and trim will stand out; should be shingled. North elevation connector dormer is strange massing. Roof walk should be all natural to weather. Camp – Nothing to add. Williams – The 10-foot plate height, 8 foot door, round columns, roof walk, extended decks dying into the octagonal, gambrel pitch at top, “I” windows, and massing are all inappropriate. Over fenestrated. Dormers don’t meet the 3-foot setback. Gambrels are all out of proportion. Do not see anything except 6-over-6 windows that are approvable.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
15. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	Second dwelling	15-43	CWA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan Griffin, Chip Webster Architecture			
Public	None			
Concerns	No commissioner concerns at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main dwelling. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
16. Hunter Trust	90 Pocomo Road	New garage	15-43	CWA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ethan Griffin, Chip Webster Architecture			
Public	None			
Concerns	No commissioner concerns at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main dwelling. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
17. Burns	24 Nonantum Avenue	New dwelling	87-157	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Alex Bagmet , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(2:45) Staff – Read previous concerns. Hill-Holdgate – Things are being tweaked on a design that doesn’t work. The big front dormers don’t work, there is no identifiable main mass. Ganged windows and giant deck above the front door are inappropriate. Flush dormers and flattened roof pitch don’t help. This is a complete redesign. McLaughlin – Meeting rails should align with the gutter and “F” window should not be awning windows. Williams – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate. The design is getting worse.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Hill-Holdgate)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

Motion to Hold the following items for the September 10 meeting. (Hill-Holdgate) Carried unanimously

18. Schmid, Peter	9 E Street – MAB	Revisions	42.4.1-14	Permits Plus
19. Ferm, John	4 Old Westmoor Farm Road	Revisions	41-820	Workshop/APD

V. HDC BUSINESS

Review Minutes -	July 2 nd , July 30 th , Aug 1 st
Approve Minutes -	July 16 th , 23 rd , 25 th
Other Business -	1. APPEAL: 74-76 Centre Street, fence, scheduled with the BOS for September 17 th , 2013. Request Legal Services. 2. St. Paul's preservation restriction
Commission Comments	

Motion to Adjourn: 2:56 p.m.

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board